RATER SOURCE EFFECTS ARE ALIVE AND WELL AFTER ALL

PERSONNEL PSYCHOLOGY 2010, 63, 119-151

BRIAN HOFFMAN ET AL.

The pervasiveness of idiosyncratic rater effects has been a focus of psychologists for over a century (Wells, 1907). Alternately referred to as halo error (Thorndike, 1920), logical error (Newcomb, 1931), overall rater biases (Wherry, 1952), correlational bias (Kenny & Berman, 1980), illusory halo (Cooper, 1981), rater leniency/elevation (Saal, Downey, & Lahey, 1980), and idiosyncratic rater effects (Mount et al., 1998; Scullen et al., 2000), a variety of terms and explanations have been used to describe the variance associated with individual raters. Although the idiosyncratic rater effect has been attributed to many different factors and has been interpreted differently by prior researchers, operationally, idiosyncratic rater effects are present to the extent that all ratings from an individual rater covary with one another but not with the ratings provided by other raters. Idiosyncratic rater factors are distinguished from the previously discussed general performance factor in that the general performance factor represents variance common across all raters and is typically assumed to represent true score variance, whereas the idiosyncratic effect is a sys- tematic effect that is common only to an individual rater and is often assumed to represent rater bias (Scullen et al., 2000). Previous rating re- search has consistently supported substantial idiosyncratic rater effects. In the context of MSPRs, Mount et al. estimated that idiosyncratic rater effects accounted for 72% of the variance in ratings, and Scullen et al. found that idiosyncratic rater effects accounted for an average of 58% of the variance in ratings across two large samples. Therefore, recent MSPR research is consistent with over a century of previous rating research findings (Cooper, 1981) that show large idiosyncratic rater effects that appear to be robust to a variety of interventions designed to reduce them (Kingstrom & Bass, 1981; Woehr & Huffcutt, 1994). Accordingly, we ex- pected to support a MSPR structure consisting of substantial idiosyncratic rater factors.